

Synergistic Effect of Bioagents and Antioxidants Against Root-Knot Nematode, *Meloidogyne incognita* on Sunflower



Ibrahim¹, D. S., Metwaly², H.A. and El-Sagheer^{3(*)}, A. M.

¹Dept. Nematodes diseases and Central Lab. Biotechnol., Plant Pathol. Res. Inst., Agric. Res. Center, Giza, Egypt

²Central Lab. Organic Agriculture, Agric. Res. Center, Giza, Egypt

^{3*}Agric. Zool. and Nematol. Dept., Fac. Agric., Al-Azhar Univ., Assiut, Egypt

*Corresponding author email: atefelsagheer@azhar.edu.eg

Received: 13 July 2021

Revised: 27 July 2021

Accepted : 29 July 2021

ABSTRACT

Root-knot nematodes are globally considered one of the most common phytonematodes infecting sunflower crops. In this context, current study, treatments were designed to enhancing the effect of biological control against *Meloidogyne incognita* by *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Bacillus subtilis* alone or in combination with antioxidant; ascorbic and salicylic acids. All treatments significantly suppressed root-knot nematode compared to control. Generally, the results indicated that the treatments of mixtures of antioxidants + bioagents showed a better response in suppression of root-knot nematode than the bioagents alone, as mixture of *T. harzianum* + *B. subtilis* gave the highest reduction in nematode population (72.3% and 80.0%). While the best synergistic effect was noticed by combination between *T. harzianum* and salicylic acid (74.9% and 84.9%) during the growing seasons 2018 and 2019, respectively. This positively reflected on the plant health through induction of defense related components (phenolic content and oxidative enzymes).

Keywords: Bioagents; Antioxidants; Root-knot nematodes; Sunflower.

INTRODUCTION

Sunflower, *Helianthus annuus* L. is considered one of the oilseed crops, It was ranked third as an oil crop globally produced (Pilorge, 2020 and Khan et al., 2015). In Egypt, the cultivated area of sunflowers reached 10,000 hectares, with total productivity 19,000 tons (USDA, 2019). Among the wide range of pests and pathogens that affect sunflowers, phytonematodes represent one of the most important obstacles to sunflower production (Fourie et al., 2010). *Meloidogyne incognita* represents the predominant root-knot nematode species in leguminous and oilseed crops (Devappa, 1996; Fourie et al., 2017).

In Egypt, root-knot nematode, *Meloidogyne incognita* (Kofoid and White, 1919) Chitwood, 1949 is the most deleterious phytonematodes contributing to stunting, wilting, poor plant growth and significant yield losses (Ibrahim and Mokbel, 2009; El-Sagheer, 2019). Bio-control of soil borne pathogens as phytonematodes by antagonistic microorganisms has been regarded as a more acceptable alternative to existing chemical methods to decrease the populations of phytonematodes (Askary and Martinelli, 2015).

Bacillus is a genus of gram-positive, rod-shaped bacteria, a member of the phylum Firmicutes, producing numerous bioactive ingredients with an expansive range of activities towards pathogens or stimulating induced resistance (Mazzuchelli et al., 2020). Among the promising bacteria as a bio-agent to control of soil pathogens, *Bacillus subtilis* represents one of the most studied (Bettiol and Morandi, 2009). This bacterium is local natural in soil in Egypt (Abd-Elsalam and El-Hanafy, 2009), produces enzymes, plant hormones and antibiotics which provide benefits to plants, and improve their growth (Silveira, 2001). In addition to the beneficial effects on the crop yield, *B. subtilis* was able to control *M. incognita* in vegetable crops through a wide spectrum of effects that bacterium has in suppressing plant nematodes and was mentioned in previous studies (Araujo, 2008; de Araújo et al., 2011; Higaki and Araujo, 2012; Vlamakis et al., 2013; Rao et al., 2014) which nominated it as one of the most important control factors that its effects must be expanded in the suppression of plant nematodes (Bettiol and Morandi, 2009).

The filamentous fungi, *Trichoderma* spp., one of a hyphomycetes fungal species have been used and applied in recent decades for phytonematodes biocontrol (Kerry, 2000). Through an interaction of many mechanisms, *Trichoderma* spp. have antagonist effects on phytonematodes including; (a) direct mycoparasitism which involves the production of cell-wall-degrading enzymes (Lorito et al., 2010), (b) producing chitinase into the culture or rhizosphere which might help in the inhibition of egg hatching. (Sharon et al., 2001), (c) the conidia of *Trichoderma* parasitize on nematode cuticle or/and egg shell (Sharon et al., 2007), (d) help plants in tolerance against stress condition by enhancing the root development through promoting to solubilization of inorganic nutrients (Sharma and Rakesh, 2009), (e) producing a variety of metabolites (mycotoxins) which inhibit egg-hatching and juveniles development (Naserinasab et al., 2011).

The interaction between several factors within the biological control strategy represents an effective approach to reduce nematode damage to plants (Sikora, 1992; Kerry, 2000). In this context, using some organic acids (ascorbic and salicylic acids) on plant growth and yield of sunflower as well as their effects on reproduction and development of many phytonematodes were studied (Seo and Kim, 2014; Kim et al., 2018). Ascorbic acid is a non-enzymatic antioxidant ($C_6H_8O_6$) which plays an important role in the activation of biological defense mechanisms of plants to pathogens such as root-knot nematodes. (Arrigoni et al., 1979). (Al-Sayed and Thomason 1988) found that solutions of ascorbic acid suppressed the numbers of second stage juveniles, females, egg masses, and root galls of *M. incognita* root-knot nematode on other hosts. Ascorbic acid gave the best nematode control and plant growth. Mohamed (2005) examined different concentration levels of ascorbic acid (2500, 5000 and 10.000 ppm.) for controlling *M. incognita* on sunflower. Where he stated that all the tested concentrations reduced nematode build up relative to control. A significant reduction in nematode population and counts of egg masses / root and improved growth parameters in plant were obtained by 1000 ppm concentration.

Salicylic acid is known as a key endogenous signal molecule in the induction of defense mechanisms that mediates defense gene expression and disease resistance in many dicotyledonous species (Renault et al., 1996). Exogenous application of SA and functionally related analogues, including ($C_6H_4(OH)COOH$) has been shown to induce resistance to nematode pathogens in both dicotyledonous and monocotyledonous plants (Hammerschmidt and Smith-Becker, 1999 and Klessig et al., 2000). Nandi et al. (2002) who reported that the application of salicylic acid significantly reduced the number of nematode second stage juveniles, other

developmental stages and consequently lowered reproduction factor of *M. incognita* on cowpea plants. The mode of action of salicylic acid i.e. could enhance defense mechanisms in the plant tissue (Sirohi and Rohatgi, 2006) and increase resistance against *Meloidogyne* spp. (Nandi et al., 2002; Canet et al., 2010; Osman et al., 2012).

So, the current study aims to study the synergistic or combination suppression effects of bioagents (*Trichoderma harzianum* and *Bacillus subtilis*) and antioxidants (ascorbic and salicylic acids) as synergistic biological control strategy against root-knot nematode, *M. incognita* on sunflower.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Preparation of *Meloidogyne incognita*

Egg masses were collected from roots of coleus plants (*Coleus blumei* L.) heavily infected with *M. incognita* grown in horticultural nursery and propagated on coleus plants as highly susceptible host for 3 months under greenhouse conditions at Nematology Research Unit, Plant Pathology Research Institute, Giza, Egypt. A sodium hypochlorite (NaOCl) extraction technique (Hussey and Barker, 1973) was undertaken in order to collect eggs of *M. incognita*. Infected roots were washed to free of soil and cut into 2-3 cm segments. Root segments were, then shaken in 200ml of 1.0% NaOCl solution for 1-2 minutes. NaOCl solution was quickly passed through a 60-mesh sieve nested over a 400-mesh sieve to collect free eggs. A 400-mesh sieve with eggs was quickly placed under a stream of tap water to remove residual NaOCl and eggs were collected. The remaining roots were rinsed with water to remove additional eggs which were collected.

Propagation of bioagents

Both isolates of bioagents provided by Central Lab. of Organic Agriculture, Agricultural Research Center, Egypt. *Bacillus subtilis* isolate was grown in liquid nutrient glucose medium (NGM) developed by Dowson (1957) for 2 days at 25°C. and prepared at concentration 20×10^7 CFU/ ml. *Trichoderma harzianum* isolate was grown on liquid gliotoxin fermentation medium (GFM) developed by Brain and Hemming (1945) for 11 days under complete darkness condition at 25°C to stimulate toxin production. Then, was prepared as suspension at concentration of 30×10^6 CFU / ml. To increase adhesive capacity and improve distribution of bioagent on the surface of treated seeds, suspensions were mixed with 5 % Arabic gum and 0.5 % potassium soap.

Preparation of mixture of bioagents

To increase the efficacy of the different single bioagents on nematode control, combinations of the two used bioagents were prepared; each mixture was prepared by mixing the two antagonists at the rate 1:1.

Preparation of antioxidants

Two different organic acids as antioxidants (ascorbic and salicylic acids) were formulated singly and/or combined. Solution of each organic acid was prepared by dissolving in 2 g/ L water. Seeds of sunflowers cv. 162 were separately dipped in each of these solutions for 30 minutes.

Preparation of mixture of bioagents with antioxidants

The two bioagents were mixed separately either with ascorbic acid or salicylic acid at the rate 1:1 (v: v), immediately before the treatment at the same time without direct mixing, to compare the effect of these mixtures with the effect of either single bioagent or single antioxidant. The treatments of tested materials were as follows: 1. Salicylic acid; 2. Ascorbic acid; 3. Salicylic acid + Ascorbic acid; 4. *B. subtilis*; 5.

T.harzianum; 6. *B.subtilis* + *T.harzianum*; 7. *B.subtilis* + Salicylic acid; 8. *B.subtilis* + Ascorbic acid; 9. *T.harzianum* + Ascorbic acid; 10. *T. harzianum* + Salicylic acid and 11. Control.

Laboratory Experiments

Evaluation of *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Bacillus subtilis* alone or combination with ascorbic and salicylic acids on egg hatching and mortality of *M. incognita*.

Eggs hatching test

In vitro studies, ten egg masses in medium size (Al-Sayed and Thomason 1988), similar age and undifferentiated, were immersed in 5 ml of each single treatment on tissue paper in petri dishes, and covered to avoid evaporation and placed at room temperature ($26\pm 2^{\circ}\text{C}$) on laboratory bench. Each treatment was replicated three times, egg masses in equal volumes of distilled water served as control. The number of emerged second-stage juveniles as the percentages of hatched eggs inhibition were calculated at 24, 48 and 72 hours (Southey, 1986). Egg masses hatching inhibition percentage and mean number of juvenile hatching per egg mass were calculated using the following formula:

$$\text{Mean number of non hatched eggs per egg mass} = \left(\frac{\text{Number of non hatched eggs in treatment}}{\text{Initial no. egg masses}} \right)$$

Hatching inhibition %

$$= \left(\frac{\text{Number of non hatched eggs in treatment} - \text{Number of non hatched eggs in control}}{\text{Total number of eggs}} \right) \times 100$$

Mortality test

Egg masses were picked from the galled sunflower roots and incubated in sterile distilled water at room conditions at $26\pm 2^{\circ}\text{C}$ for 48 hours (Lee and Atkinson 1976). Hatched second stage juveniles that had passed through the tissue paper into the petri dish were counted and concentrated until reached 1 ml of distilled water. Approximately 100 second stage juveniles (J_2) were used for each of treatments including the control. Population density of second stage juveniles (J_2) in stock suspension (100 J_2 /1ml distilled water) was considered as mean population number from 3 times of 1 ml of stock suspension. 1 ml of this juveniles suspension poured in screw-capped test tubes which contained 5 ml of different concentrations of tested materials timely prepared and incubated in dark at $26\pm 2^{\circ}\text{C}$ for four days and the numbers of dead juveniles were counted at 24, 48 and 72 hours (Demeure and Freckman 1981), using nematode counting slide in accordance with the Hussey and Barker (1973) technique modified by Boneti and Ferraz (1981). Each treatment was replicated three times, distilled water served as control. The corrected mortality percentages were calculated according to the Abbott's formula (1925). The J_2 mortality (%) were assessed as compared to the control according to the following equation; juvenile mortality % = $[(C_1 - C_2) / C_1] \times 100$ Where C_1 is the number of dead nematode juveniles in treatment and C_2 is the number of dead nematode juveniles in control.

Nematode inoculum preparation

Females and egg masses of *Meloidogyne incognita* were isolated from infected sunflower roots. Cultures of this nematode species were established from single egg-masses of adult females previously identified by the morphological characteristics of the female perineal patterns (Taylor and Sasser, 1978) and reared on Rutgers sunflower plants in a greenhouse. The root-knot nematode eggs were extracted from

infected sunflower roots using sodium hypochlorite (NaOCl) solution as described by Hussey and Barker (1973).

Field Experiment design

Evaluation of *T. harzianum* and *B. subtilis* alone or combination with ascorbic and salicylic acids on sunflower infected with *M. incognita* under field conditions.

In order to study the effects of two antioxidants (ascorbic acid and salicylic acid) as well as the two bioagents (*T. harzianum* and *B. subtilis*) singly and/or mixed on controlling root-knot nematode, *M. incognita* infecting sunflower and their effect on plant growth parameters of sunflower, a field experiment was carried out in Agricultural Research Center, Giza governorate over the course of two successive seasons (2018/2019). The experiment covered a total area of 150 m², in a randomized complete block design with four replicates per treatment. Each plot consisted of two rows, 30 cm wide and 3m long. Sunflower seeds cv. 162 were dipped tested materials for 30 minutes and kept in cheese cloths for 3 days before sowing. Treated sunflowers seeds were transplanted in infected plots at the rate of 5 seeds/ plot. Untreated sunflower seeds cv.162 were used as control. All agricultural practices were carried out according to the recommendations of the Ministry of Agriculture, Egypt.

Sixty plots for each experimental location were planted with (2-3 seeds/hill) of sunflower. One week later, plants were treated with treatments as soil drench, the antioxidants solutions were prepared at a level of 2000 ppm. Through eleven treatments (as previously mentioned), suspension of each treatment was prepared at a level of 0.1 L /10 L distilled water each. Plants were foliar sprayed by treatments at 2 times, with 14 days interval. Four plots were freed of any treatment served as control. Plants were harvested, 45 days after treating, and roots were washed to free from adhering soil. Data dealing with fresh shoot and root weights, dry shoot weight, shoot and root lengths, were recorded. Second stage juveniles (J₂s) were extracted from soil using sieving and modified Baermann technique (Goodey, 1957). Roots were stained in 0.01 acid fuchsin (Byrd et al., 1983) and examined for the developmental stages, females, galls, and egg-masses under stereomicroscope. Root galling or egg masses were rated on a scale of 0-5 where 0= no galls or egg masses, 1= 1-2 galls or egg masses, 2= 3-10 galls or egg masses, 3= 11-30 galls or egg masses, 4= 31-100 galls or egg masses, 5= more than 100 galls or egg masses per root system (Taylor and Sasser, 1978).

Chemical analysis

Phenolic contents estimation

Free, conjugated and total phenols were determined by mixing 1 ml of the sample extract with 0.25 ml HCL and boiled in a water bath for 10 minutes, then left to cool. One ml of the reagent folin-Denis and 6 ml Na₂CO₃, were added. The mixture was completed to final volume (10 ml) using distilled water. Color optical density of the reacted mixture was measured on absorbance spectrophotometer Miltonroy Spectronic 601 at 520 nm (Snell and Snell, 1953). Phenol content was determined as mg/g fresh weight/min.

Enzymes assay

Enzyme extracts were prepared following the method described by Maxwell and Bateman (1967). Dry root tissues (0.5 g) of each treatment were ground in 3 ml Na-

phosphate buffer at pH 6.8 in a mortar and then, centrifuged at 1.500 g / 20 min at 6 °C. The resultant supernatant fluids were processed for enzyme assays.

Polyphenol oxidase was assayed using photochemical method as described by Coseteng and Lee (1987). The reacted mixture was added as the following sequences: 2.7 ml potassium phosphate buffer 90.05M, pH 6.2, 0.25 ml of 0.25 M catechol, and 0.05 ml of enzyme extract. The increasing in absorbance at 420 nm was measured. One unit of enzyme activity is defined as the amount of the enzyme that causes an increase of 0.001 absorbance units per minute at 25°C.

Peroxidase was assayed using photochemical method as described by Amako et al. (1994). The reacted mixture was added as the following sequences, 1500 ml phosphate buffer, 480 ml hydrogen peroxidase, 1000 ml pyrogallol, and 20 ml sample extract. The increasing in the absorbance at 430 nm was recorded against blank with phosphate buffer instead of enzyme extract. One unit of enzyme activity was defined as the amount of the enzyme, which changing the optical density at 430 nm per min. at 25°C under standard assay conditions. Specific activity was expressed in units as mg/g/fresh weight/min

The activity of catalase was determined as described by Aebi (1974). Enzyme extract (0.1ml) was added to 2.9 ml of a reacted mixture containing 0.3M. H₂O₂ 5% and 0.5M sodium phosphate buffer (pH 7.6). The activity of catalase was measured by monitoring the reduction in the absorbance at 240 nm as a result of H₂O₂ consumption. Catalase activity was expressed in unit as mg/g/fresh weight/min. One unit of enzyme activity was defined as the decomposition of 1µmol of H₂O₂ per min.

Data Analysis

The experiments were repeated twice (in two seasons) to confirm the results. Data obtained were subjected to statistical analysis of variance (ANOVA) for completely randomized design and randomized complete block design. The means were compared according to Duncan's multiple range tests at $P \leq 0.05$ (Duncan, 1955).

RESULTS

Evaluation of *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Bacillus subtilis* alone or in combination with ascorbic and salicylic acids on egg hatching and mortality of *Meloidogyne incognita* in vitro.

Data in Table (1) represented the effect of the ascorbic and salicylic acids as well as the *T. harzianum* and *B. subtilis* on egg hatching inhibition and juveniles mortality of *M. incognita*. All the tested treatments were found to cause significant inhibition in hatching and juveniles mortality percent to various extents. The dual treatment of Ascorbic acid + Salicylic acid sustained the highest and the most significant percentage of juvenile mortality (96.7 %) followed by the combination of *T. harzianum* + Salicylic acid (64.7%). However, the least percentage of mortality was recorded with Ascorbic acid (21.0%) followed by *B. subtilis* (38.0%).

The previously mentioned treatments at three tested exposure periods showed nematicidal activity against egg hatching. Meanwhile, the dual treatment of *T. harzianum* + Salicylic acid achieved the highest percentage of egg hatching after 72 h (100 %), then the combination of *T. harzianum* + *B. subtilis* (97.0 %). The least one, Ascorbic acid recorded 36.0% after 72 h.

Table 1: Evaluation of *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Bacillus subtilis* alone or in combination with ascorbic and salicylic acids on egg hatching inhibition and mortality of *Meloidogyne incognita* after intervals (hrs.) *in vitro*

| Treatments | Mortality % | | | Egg hatching inhibition % |
|--|-------------|------|-------|---------------------------|
| | 24hr | 48hr | 72hr | |
| Ascorbic acid | 16.0 | 27.0 | 36.0 | 21.0 |
| Salicylic acid | 29.7 | 37.4 | 48.7 | 45.4 |
| Ascorbic acid + Salicylic acid | 33.0 | 52.0 | 84.0 | 96.7 |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> | 28.0 | 55.0 | 63.4 | 38.0 |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> | 30.4 | 47.0 | 68.0 | 44.0 |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + <i>T. harzianum</i> | 34.7 | 69.4 | 97.0 | 52.7 |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + Ascorbic acid | 13.4 | 37.0 | 44.7 | 37.4 |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + Salicylic acid | 20.0 | 37.4 | 52.7 | 44.4 |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> + Ascorbic acid | 28.0 | 52.0 | 75.4 | 45.4 |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> + Salicylic acid | 34.0 | 75.0 | 100.0 | 64.7 |
| Nematode alone (control) | 0.0 | 0.0i | 0.0 | 16.0 |

Each value represents the mean of four replicates.

Evaluation of *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Bacillus subtilis* alone or in combination with ascorbic and salicylic acids on *Meloidogyne incognita* criteria on sunflower plants under field conditions

Influence of *T. harzianum* and *B. subtilis* alone or in combination with ascorbic and salicylic acids against root-knot nematode, *M. incognita* infecting sunflower (cv. 162) was evaluated under open field conditions. Data presented in Table (2) revealed that the nematode criteria; numbers of root galls, developmental stages/root, number of nematodes in soil, number of eggs/egg mass, final population, and rate of nematode reproduction were significantly ($P < 0.05$) reduced and nematode reduction was significantly increased ($P \leq 0.05$) as compared with control. In addition, data showed that *M. incognita* population density whether in soil or roots was significantly suppressed with reproduction factor (Rf) ranging from 0.09 to 0.79 and 0.15 to 0.56 compared to nematode alone (Rf = 1.54 and 1.41) for the first and second seasons, respectively. Among screened treatments, *T. harzianum* combined with salicylic acid exhibited the greatest reduction (74.89 and 84.9%) followed by *T. harzianum* combined with *B. subtilis* (72.3 and 80.0%) and the dual treatment of two antioxidants, Ascorbic acid and Salicylic acid caused 70.0 and 76.1% for the first and second seasons, respectively. However, the least reductions in total nematode populations were recorded with *B. subtilis* + Ascorbic acid (48.5%) and Salicylic acid (59.6%) for the first and second seasons, respectively. Also, root galling of *M. incognita* was significantly reduced by all the tested treatments with root gall index (RGI) ranging from 3.0 to 3.5 and 0.66 to 3.0, for the first and second seasons, respectively. Similarly, nematode fecundity was significantly affected by certain treatments with egg masses index (EI) ranging from 2.0 to 3.3 and 0.0 to 3.0 for the first and second seasons, respectively. The highest percentages of reduction in root galling occurred by *T. harzianum* combined with Salicylic acid (65.2 and 65.5%) and *T. harzianum* combined with *B. subtilis* (60.9 and 71.0%) in root galling and *T. harzianum* combined with Ascorbic acid (64.3 and 76.0%) in egg masses reduction compared to control for the first and second seasons, respectively.

Table 2: Evaluation of *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Bacillus subtilis* alone or in combination with ascorbic and salicylic acids on *Meloidogyne incognita* criteria on sunflower plants under field conditions during two growing seasons, 2018 and 2019.

| Treatments | Criteria of root-knot nematode | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|--------------------------------|-----------------|---------|--------|-----------------------|-------------|---------------------|--------------|--------|-----------------|-------------------|--------|------------------|
| | Soil | | Root | | Final population (Pf) | % Reduction | Reproduction factor | No. of galls | Red. % | Root gall index | No. of egg masses | Red. % | Egg masses index |
| | 2 nd juve niles | Develop. stages | Females | | | | | | | | | | |
| First season (2018) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Ascorbic acid | 498.0de | 2.7ce | 17.0cd | 517.7 | 66.4 | 0.52 | 30.0 b | 34.8 | 3.5 | 27.0 a | 3.6 | 3.3 | |
| Salicylic acid | 451.0ef | 4.0bc | 19.0bc | 474.0 | 69.2 | 0.47 | 30.0 b | 34.8 | 3.0 | 25.0 ab | 10.7 | 3.0 | |
| Ascorbic acid + Salicylic acid | 448.0ef | 3.0be | 11.0f | 462.0 | 70.0 | 0.46 | 29.0 bc | 37.0 | 3.0 | 25.0 ab | 10.7 | 3.0 | |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> | 714.0bc | 3.3be | 13.0ef | 730.3 | 52.6 | 0.73 | 24.0 bd | 47.8 | 3.3 | 21.0 bc | 25.0 | 3.0 | |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> | 552.0d | 4.0bc | 10.0f | 566.0 | 63.2 | 0.57 | 20.0 df | 56.5 | 3.0 | 18.0 ce | 35.7 | 3.0 | |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + <i>T. harzianum</i> | 414.0fg | 2.7ce | 10.0f | 426.7 | 72.3 | 0.43 | 18.0 df | 60.9 | 3.0 | 16.0 cf | 42.9 | 3.0 | |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + Ascorbic acid | 767.0b | 4.3ab | 21.0b | 792.3 | 48.5 | 0.79 | 23.0 ce | 50.0 | 3.8 | 19.0 bd | 32.1 | 2.5 | |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + Salicylic acid | 646.0c | 2.3de | 16.0cd | 664.3 | 56.8 | 0.66 | 23.0 ce | 50.0 | 3.0 | 15.0 cf | 46.4 | 2.8 | |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> + Ascorbic acid | 509.0de | 3.0be | 12.0f | 524.0 | 66.0 | 0.52 | 22.0 cf | 52.2 | 3.0 | 10.0 fi | 64.3 | 2.0 | |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> + Salicylic acid | 367.0gi | 3.7bd | 16.0de | 386.7 | 74.9 | 0.39 | 16.0 fg | 65.2 | 3.0 | 13.0 dg | 53.6 | 2.5 | |
| Nematode alone | 1502.0a | 5.3b | 33.0a | 1540.3 | 0.0 | 1.54 | 46.0 a | 0.0 | 4.0 | 28.0 a | 0.0 | 3.3 | |
| Second season (2019) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Ascorbic acid | 399.0 d-g | 6.0ab | 29.0 b | 447.0 | 67.8 | 0.45 | 21.0bc | 41.0 | 3.0 | 13.0c | 48.0 | 3.0 | |
| Salicylic acid | 517.0 cd | 3.0dg | 27.0 bc | 560.0 | 59.6 | 0.56 | 18.0cd | 49.1 | 3.0 | 13.0c | 48.0 | 3.0 | |
| Ascorbic acid + Salicylic acid | 299.0 dh | 4.0be | 21.0 ce | 331.0 | 76.1 | 0.33 | 12.0f | 65.5 | 3.0 | 7.0de | 73.2 | 2.0 | |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> | 476.0 c-f | 2.0eh | 18.0 df | 505.0 | 63.6 | 0.51 | 14.0ef | 60.1 | 3.0 | 9.0de | 64.0 | 2.3 | |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> | 399.0 dg | 8.0a | 21.0 ce | 436.0 | 68.6 | 0.44 | 12.0f | 65.5 | 3.0 | 8.0de | 68.0 | 2.3 | |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + <i>T. harzianum</i> | 253.0 eh | 4.0be | 15.0dh | 278.0 | 80.0 | 0.28 | 10.0f | 71.0 | 2.0 | 6.0ef | 76.0 | 2.0 | |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + Ascorbic acid | 238.0 fh | 6.0ab | 21.0ce | 283.0 | 80.0 | 0.28 | 23.0b | 35.5 | 3.0 | 18.0 b | 29.2 | 3.0 | |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + Salicylic acid | 395.0 dg | 2.0eh | 19.0de | 426.0 | 69.3 | 0.43 | 17.0de | 51.9 | 3.0 | 10.0d | 61.2 | 2.0 | |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> + Ascorbic acid | 391.0 dg | 4.0be | 11.0fi | 412.0 | 70.3 | 0.41 | 12.0f | 51.9 | 3.0 | 6.0de | 76.0 | 2.0 | |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> + Salicylic acid | 176.0 gi | 5.0bd | 20.0de | 210.0 | 84.9 | 0.21 | 17.0de | 65.5 | 3.00 | 9.0de | 64.0 | 2.3 | |
| Nematode alone (Control) | 1309.0 a | 6.0ab | 47.0 a | 1387.0 | 0.0 | 1.41 | 36.7a | 0.0 | 4.00 | 25.0a | 0.0 | 3.0 | |

Each value represents the mean of four replicates. Initial population = 1000 second stage juveniles of *M. incognita*. Means in each column followed by the same letter(s) did not significantly different at ($P \leq 0.05$) according to Duncan multiple range test -

Reproduction factor (Rf) = Final population /Initial population. Nematode final population (Pf) = [Egg masses no. /root × Eggs no. / Egg masses] + [Developmental stages/root] + [Second stage juveniles /soil] + [Adult females/root]. Root gall index (RGI) or egg masses index (EI) was determined according to the scale given by Taylor and Sasser (1978).

Evaluation of *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Bacillus subtilis* alone or combination with ascorbic and salicylic acids on vegetative characteristics of sunflower infected with *Meloidogyne incognita* under field conditions

Effects of *T. harzianum* and *B. subtilis* alone or combination with ascorbic and salicylic acids on vegetative characteristics of sunflower (cv. 162) infected with *M. incognita* under field conditions, were estimated under open field conditions. Data Tables (3 and 4) revealed that, all of the tested treatments recorded significant increases of plant growth characteristics ($P \leq 0.05$) and decreased the negative effects of nematodes on plants compared control.

Table 3: Evaluation of *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Bacillus subtilis* alone or in combination with ascorbic and salicylic acids on of growth parameters of sunflower infected with *Meloidogyne incognita* under field conditions.

| Treatments | Increase% in growth parameters | | | | | |
|--|--------------------------------|--------|----------------|--------|----------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| | Shoot increase% | | Root increase% | | Increase in Total fresh weight % | Increase in Shoot dry weight % |
| | Length | Weight | Length | Weight | | |
| Ascorbic acid | 18.17 | 38.140 | 63.8 | 62.62 | 28.7 | 55.7 |
| Salicylic acid | 23.61 | 45.161 | 25.8 | 7.01 | 40.3 | 65.3 |
| Ascorbic acid+ Salicylic acid | 26.50 | 51.992 | 12.5 | 57.01 | 48.7 | 75.4 |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> | 18.75 | 23.150 | 3.3 | 42.06 | 21.0 | 25.7 |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> | 65.28 | 60.152 | 2.5 | 43.93 | 55.8 | 63.5 |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + <i>T. harzianum</i> | 45.49 | 37.761 | 37.5 | 60.75 | 35.4 | 46.1 |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + Ascorbic acid | 12.62 | 44.972 | 43.8 | 53.27 | 41.9 | 61.7 |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + Salicylic acid | 37.38 | 53.131 | 35.4 | 51.40 | 49.5 | 63.5 |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> + Ascorbic acid | 15.74 | 38.140 | 40.0 | 49.53 | 35.4 | 35.9 |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> + Salicylic acid | 46.76 | 68.311 | 25.4 | 43.93 | 63.5 | 99.4 |

Each value represents mean of four replicates. The increase was calculated as a percentage of the control.

Table 4: Evaluation of *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Bacillus subtilis* alone or in combination with ascorbic and salicylic acids on growth parameters of sunflower infected with *Meloidogyne incognita* under field conditions during growing season, 2019.

| Treatments | Increase% in growth parameters | | | | | |
|--|--------------------------------|--------|-----------------|--------|----------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| | Shoot increase% | | Root increase % | | Increase in Total fresh weight % | Increase in Shoot dry weight % |
| | Length | Weight | Length | Weight | | |
| Ascorbic acid | 3.34 | 45.06 | 44.75 | 152.54 | 45.7 | 53.0 |
| Salicylic acid | 11.08 | 47.33 | 24.66 | 58.47 | 45.8 | 84.6 |
| Ascorbic acid + Salicylic acid | 28.84 | 52.67 | 18.27 | 114.41 | 34.4 | 91.3 |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> | 8.54 | 24.90 | 0.46 | 60.17 | 24.4 | 41.6 |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> | 34.45 | 58.64 | 10.51 | 65.25 | 56.8 | 69.7 |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + <i>T. harzianum</i> | 34.58 | 46.50 | 30.59 | 143.22 | 46.9 | 56.3 |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + Ascorbic acid | 8.01 | 50.00 | 41.09 | 107.63 | 49.5 | 63.4 |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + Salicylic acid | 31.38 | 60.91 | 28.31 | 85.59 | 59.5 | 81.6 |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> + Ascorbic acid | 14.55 | 44.86 | 36.71 | 80.51 | 43.9 | 77.3 |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> + Salicylic acid | 53.40 | 63.17 | 22.84 | 68.64 | 61.3 | 130.7 |

Each value represents mean of four replicates. The increase was calculated as a percentage of the control.

The obtained results indicated that the treatments, *T. harzianum* as well as *B. subtilis* combined with salicylic acid showed remarkable improvement in total plant fresh weight as well as dry shoot weight of infected sunflower. However, the dual treatment of *T. harzianum* + salicylic acid appeared to be the most effective in increasing total plant fresh weight (63.5 and 61.3%) and shoot dry weight (99.4 and 119.0%) compared to control during the two growing seasons 2018 and 2019, respectively. Using *B. subtilis* alone, the lowest values in fresh and dry shoot weights were noticed

Evaluation of *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Bacillus subtilis* alone or in combination with ascorbic and salicylic acids on phenolic contents and oxidative enzymes of sunflower infected with *Meloidogyne incognita* under field conditions.

As a clear indicator of plant response to previous treatments under nematode invasion, data indicated that phenolic contents were significantly affected by the tested bioagents and antioxidants on sunflower during the two growing seasons, 2018 and 2019. Results in Table (5) indicated that, phenolic contents including the free, conjugated, and total phenols were noticeably higher in some treated plants than the control during the two growing seasons, 2018 and 2019. The highest total phenolic contents were induced by combination of *T. harzianum* + salicylic acid treatment, which recorded 12.49 and 12.81 in the two seasons, respectively. This is consistent with the results of vegetative growth and nematode criteria.

Concerning formation of oxidative enzymes in sunflower, the obtained data in Table (6) indicated that the lowest values of oxidative enzyme were detected in control. Generally, the two antioxidants and the two bioagents either individually or combined succeeded to increase enzymes activity, In this respect, the highest activities in all determined enzymes were induced by mixture of *T. harzianum* + salicylic acids compared to other treatments during the two growing seasons 2018 and 2019. When bioagents were evaluated regarding oxidative enzyme. *T. harzianum* showed the highest effect than *B. subtilis* on peroxidase (PO), catalase and polyphenoloxidase (PPO) during the two growing seasons 2018 and 2019.

DISCUSSION

Generally, the average rate of nematode suppression found in this study was consistent with previous studies (Molinari and Miacola, 1997; Henkle-Dührsen and Kampkötter, 2001; Mahgoob and Zaghlool, 2002; Goswami and Singh, 2004). Application of *T. harzianum* revealed the most significant biocontrol activity against root-knot nematode *M. incognita* *in vitro* and *in vivo*. Toward improving the biocontrol strategy, we studied its effect on root-knot nematode under field conditions of Egypt. In our results, *T. harzianum* and *B. subtilis* as bioagents represented the most effective treatments for suppression of nematode *in vitro* and *in vivo* either alone or in combination with antioxidants. These results agreed with those obtained by Spiegel and Chet (1998) who reported that reducing egg production of the root-knot nematode occurred by soil treatments with *T. harzianum*. Also, Goswami et al. (2008) mentioned that this effect may be due to fewer nematodes were able to penetrate the roots in treated soil by *T. harzianum*. This was noted by Khan and Haque (2011) who suggested the ability of *T. harzianum* effects may be occurred also through antibiosis production (Nielson et al., 1998), siderophore production (Glick, 1995), production of phytohormones and induced systemic resistance (Kloepper et al., 1992) or other compounds with some nematicidal properties (Marek and Skorupska, 2001; Leonetti et al., 2017).

Table 5: Evaluation of *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Bacillus subtilis* alone or in combination with ascorbic and salicylic acids on phenolic content of sunflower infected with *Meloidogyne incognita* under field conditions during the two growing seasons 2018 and 2019.

| Treatments | Phenol components (mg/g fresh weight/min) | | | | | |
|--|---|--------------------|--------------|----------------------|--------------------|-------------|
| | First season (2018) | | | Second season (2019) | | |
| | Total phenols | Conjugated phenols | Free phenols | Total phenols | Conjugated phenols | Free phenol |
| Ascorbic acid | 5.98g | 2.67h | 3.32ab | 5.10h | 3.35fg | 1.74 de |
| Salicylic acid | 8.78e | 6.37d | 2.41efg | 5.68gh | 3.12fgh | 2.56abc |
| Ascorbic acid + Salicylic acid | 10.78cd | 8.22c | 2.56ab | 10.41de | 8.00c | 2.42bc |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> | 6.63ef | 4.45f | 2.18fg | 6.77g | 4.63f | 2.03d |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> | 10.75cd | 8.10cd | 2.65cde | 8.93f | 6.62de | 2.31bcd |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + <i>T. harzianum</i> | 12.69c | 9.69bc | 3.00c | 13.40b | 10.87b | 2.54abc |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + Ascorbic acid | 9.00d | 5.98de | 3.02c | 9.39e | 6.94d | 2.44c |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + Salicylic acid | 8.94de | 5.15def | 3.80a | 9.04ef | 6.34def | 2.69ab |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> + Ascorbic acid | 12.49b | 9.82b | 2.68cd | 12.81c | 10.44bc | 2.37bcd |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> + Salicylic acid | 15.69a | 12.56a | 3.13bc | 15.12a | 12.32a | 2.80a |
| Control | 4.49h | 3.00gh | 1.48g | 3.63e | 2.24 h | 1.39e |

-Means in each column followed by the same letter(s) did not differ at $P \leq 0.05$ according to Duncan's multiple range test.

- Each value represents the mean of four replicates.

Table 6: Evaluation of *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Bacillus subtilis* alone or in combination with ascorbic and salicylic acids on oxidative enzymes of sunflower infected with *Meloidogyne incognita* under field conditions during the two growing seasons 2018 and 2019.

| Treatments | The oxidative enzymes (mg/g fresh weight/min) | | | | | |
|--|---|----------|--------------------|----------------------|----------|--------------------|
| | First season (2018) | | | Second season (2019) | | |
| | Peroxidase | Catalase | Polyphenol oxidase | Peroxidase | Catalase | Polyphenol oxidase |
| Ascorbic acid | 0.693de | 1.15a | 0.025c | 0.030cd | 1.380a | 0.84g |
| Salicylic acid | 1.196cd | 1.18a | 0.027c | 0.030cd | 1.416a | 1.44bc |
| Ascorbic acid + Salicylic acid | 1.250c | 1.28a | 0.046j | 0.062bc | 1.536a | 1.50b |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> | 0.583def | 1.23a | 0.053ab | 0.064bc | 1.476a | 0.69h |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> | 1.340bc | 1.24a | 0.058ab | 0.060bc | 1.488a | 1.61ef |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + <i>T. harzianum</i> | 1.626ab | 1.31a | 0.075ab | 0.090b | 1.572a | 1.95e |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + Ascorbic acid | 1.173cd | 1.27a | 0.046b | 0.060bc | 1.524a | 1.41bc |
| <i>B. subtilis</i> + Salicylic acid | 1.043d | 1.29a | 0.047b | 0.056bc | 1.548a | 1.26c |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> + Ascorbic acid | 1.612ab | 1.28a | 0.056ab | 0.060bc | 1.536a | 1.94e |
| <i>T. harzianum</i> + Salicylic acid | 1.711a | 1.33a | 0.082a | 0.094a | 1.596a | 2.05a |
| Control | 0.263f | 1.05a | 0.001d | 0.000d | 1.260a | 0.32d |
| L.S.D. | 0.981 | 0.920 | 0.101 | 0.120 | 1.104 | 1.177 |

Means in each column followed by the same letter(s) did not differ at $P \leq 0.05$ according to Duncan's multiple range test. Each value represents the mean of four replicates.

According to Lindberg (1981), *Bacillus* effects may be due to the nematocidal volatile products produced by this bacterium and characterized to include mainly the benzene acetaldehyde, 2-nonanone, decanal, 2-undecanone and dimethyl di-sulphide, which were active against *M. incognita* juveniles. The mechanisms by which reduction on nematode population occurred might be due to premature egg hatching and reduction in viability and mortality of juveniles which induced by non-cellular extract (filtrate) and toxic metabolites like bacillo-peptidase, subtilin and a lactamase from *Bacillus* spp. El-Sherif et al. (1994) reported that the cultures of bacteria inhibited hatching of *M. incognita* and were toxic to juveniles. Niknam and Dhawan, (2002) evaluated *B. subtilis* for its efficacy against *M. incognita* which inhibited hatching and caused mortality of immature nematodes by their cell free culture filtrates. Nagesh et al. (2005) confirmed the *B. subtilis* which produced antibiotics, and 2, 3-DHBG. This antagonist acts through antibiosis, secretion of volatile toxic metabolites, destructive enzymes, and competition for space and nutrition. Numerous antifungal metabolites are produced by bacteria that act against nematodes both *in vitro* and *in vivo* (Farkas and Kiraaly, 1962). These include bacillomycin, iturin, surfactin, mycosubtilin, bacilysin, fengymycin, mycobacillin, ammonia, butyrol actones, 2, 4- diacetyl phloroglucinol, kanosamine, oligomycin, oomycin, phenaz ine-1-carboxylic acid, pyoluterin, pyrrolnitrin, viscosinamide, xanthobaccin and zwittermycin (Mahadnanapuk et al., 2007). Ruiz et al., (2014) suggested that the cell-free culture filtrate of *B. subtilis* might contain toxic metabolites against *M. incognita*. Zaghloul et al. (2015) reported the high production of certain enzymes i.e. protease, chitinase and gelatinase by *B. subtilis* which suppressed nematodes. Chitinases from micro-organisms is a potential weapon for the control of root-knot nematodes, (the chitinolytic bacteria), because the nematode egg shell cuticle is containing of a chitin layer.

On other hand, the combination of bioagents + antioxidants (amino acids) enhanced the bioagents to reduce the ability of nematodes to develop, which were in line with Tanda et al.(1989) who reported that inhibitory effect on egg hatching and juvenile mortality in root-knot nematode, *M. incognita* on sesame root exudates *in vitro* due to their containment of amino acids as antioxidants. A similar was founded by Lee et al. (2014) and Cronin et al., 1997) where noted that with increasing concentration of acids, the egg hatching proportionally decreased. Some previous studies explained the action mode of antioxidants affecting nematodes and their reflection on the general health of plants (Ryan, 2000; Gupta et al., 2017; Labudda, 2018). The effect of antioxidants on *M. incognita* may be due to direct toxicity or the nematodes (Perry and Clarke, 1981); affected by the pH and/or osmotic pressure of the solution. (Ahmed and Khan, 1964) or may interfere with essential pathways of intracellular metabolism and enzymes in nematodes (Crow et al., 2009) or as Cooper et al. (2005) who added that the activation of signaling compounds of induced resistance promoted expression of plant defenses such as proteinase inhibitors and polyphenol oxidase, as well as volatile organic compounds that attract parasitoids of herbivores (Ryan, 2000).

CONCLUSION

The combination of bioagents, *T. harzianum* and *B. subtilis* with antioxidants, ascorbic and salicylic acids which evaluated in current study under field conditions, showed the feasibility of integration of biological control agents in the management of nematodes in sunflower crop. This synergistic method can reduce the main problems

encountered in the nematodes control and reduce environmental impacts from chemical control.

REFERENCES

- Abbott, W.S. (1925) A method of computing the effectiveness of an insecticide. *J. Econ. Entomol.* 18(2):265–267.
- Abd-Elsalam, H. E. and El-Hanafy, A. A. (2009). Lignin biodegradation with ligninolytic bacterial strain and comparison of *Bacillus subtilis* and *Bacillus* sp. isolated from Egyptian soil. *American-Eurasian. J. Agric. & Environ. Sci.* 5(1): 39-44.
- Aebi, H. (1974) Catalase. In: Bergmeyer, H.U. (Ed.). *Methods of Enzymatic Analysis* Verlag Chemie/Academic Press Inc., Weinheim / New York, pp. 673-680.
- Ahmed, A., & Khan, A. M. (1964). Factors influencing larval hatching in the root-knot nematodes, *Meloidogyne incognita* (Kofoid and White, 1919) Chitwood, 1949 and *M. javanica* (Treub, 1885) Chitwood, 1949. *Indian Phytopath.* 17(2): 98-101.
- Al-Sayed, A. A., and Thomason, I. J. (1988). *Meloidogyne incognita* and tomato response to thiamine, ascorbic acid, L-arginine, and L-glutamic acid. *J. Nematol.* 20(3): 451.
- Amako, K.; Chen, G. X. and Asada, K. (1994). Separate assays specific for ascorbate peroxidase and guaiacol peroxidase and for the chloroplastic and cytosolic isozymes of ascorbate peroxidase in plants. *Plant Cell Physiol.* 35(3): 497-504.
- Araujo, F.F.D. (2008). Seed inoculation with *Bacillus subtilis*, formulated with oyster meal and development of corn, soybean and cotton. *Sci. Agrotechnol.* 32: 456-462.
- Arrigoni, O.; Zacheo, R.; Arrigoni-liso, T.; Beleve zacheo, S. and Lamberti, F. (1979). Relationship between ascorbic acid and the resistance in tomato plants to *Meloidogyne incognita*. *J. Phytopathol.* 69: 579-581 .
- Askary, T.H and Martinelli, P.R.P. (Eds. (2015). *Biocontrol agents of phytonematodes*. CABI.
- Barker, K. R. and Hussey, R. S. (1976). Histopathology of nodular tissues of legumes infected with certain nematodes. *Phytopathology* 66(7): 851-855.
- Bettiol, W. and Morandi, M.A. (2009). *Biocontrol of plant diseases: use and perspectives*. Embrapa Meio Ambiente, 341 pp .
- Boneti, J.I.S., and Ferraz, S. (1981). Modification of the Hussey & Barker method for extracting *Meloidogyne exigua* eggs from coffee roots. *Brazilian Phytopathol.* 6(3): 13-17.
- Brain, P.W. and Hemming, H. G. (1945). Gliotoxin a fungistatic metabolic product of *Trichoderma viride*. *Annals Appl. Biol.* 32: 214-220.
- Byrd Jr, D. W.; Kirkpatrick, T. and Barker, K. (1983). An improved technique for clearing and staining plant tissues for detection of nematodes. *J. Nematol.* 15(1): 142-150.
- Canet, J. V.; Dobón, A.; Ibáñez, F.; Perales, L. and Tornero, P. (2010). Resistance and biomass in *Arabidopsis*: a new model for salicylic acid perception. *Plant Biotechnol. J.* 8(2): 126-141.
- Cooper, W. R.; Jia, L. and Goggin, L. (2005). Effects of jasmonate-induced defenses on root-knot nematode infection of resistant and susceptible tomato cultivars. *J. Chem. Ecol.* 31(9): 1953-1967.

- Coseteng, M. Y.; and Lee, C. Y. (1987). Changes in apple polyphenoloxidase and polyphenol concentrations in relation to degree of browning. *J. Food Sci.*52(4): 985-989.
- Cronin, D.; Moenne-Loccoz, Y.; Fenton, A.; Dunne, C.; Dowling, D. N., and O'Gara, F. (1997). Role of 2, 4-diacetylphloroglucinol in the interactions of the biocontrol pseudomonad strain F113 with the potato cyst nematode *Globodera rostochiensis*. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 63(4): 1357-1361.
- Crow, W. T.; Cuda, J. P., and Stevens, B. R. (2009). Efficacy of methionine against ectoparasitic nematodes on golf course turf. *J. Nematol.* 41(3): 217-220.
- De Araújo, F.; de Araújo, A. and Figueiredo, M. (2011). Role of plant growth-promoting bacteria, in sustainable agriculture. In: *Sustainable agriculture: Technology, Planning and Management* edit by Augusto Salazar and Ismael Rios. Nova Science Publishers, New York.
- Demeure, Y. V. E. S. and Freckman, D. W. (1981). Recent advances in the study of anhydrobiotic nematodes. In: Zuckerman, B. M. and Rohde, R. A. (Eds). *Plant parasitic nematodes*, vol. 3. New York: Academic Press. pp.205-226.
- Devappa, V. (1996). Assessment of yield losses due to root-knot nematode, *Meloidogyne incognita* (Kofoid and White, 1919) Chitwood, 1949 on sunflower and its management. M.Sc. Thesis, Univ. Agric. Sci., Bangalore, 73pp.
- Dowson, W. J. (1957). *Plant Diseases due to Bacteria*. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press. 232 pp. 2nd ed.
- Duncan, D.B. (1955). Multiple ranges and multiple, F-test *Biometrics*, 11:1- 42.
- El-Sagheer, A. M. (2019). Plant responses to phytonematodes infestations. In: *Plant Health Under Biotic Stress*. Springer, Singapore, pp. 161-175.
- El-Sherif, M.A.; Ali, A. H. and Barakat, M.I. (1994). Suppressive bacteria associated with plant parasitic nematodes in Egyptian agriculture. *Japanese J. Nematol.* 24(2): 55-59.
- Farkas, G.L. and Kiraaly, Z. (1962). Role of phenolic compounds in the physiology of plant diseases and disease resistance. *J. Phytopathol.* 44: 105-150.
- Fourie, H.; Mc Donald, A. H. and De Waele, D. (2010). Relationships between initial population densities of *Meloidogyne incognita* race 2 and nematode population development in terms of variable soybean resistance. *J. Nematol.* 42(1): 55.
- Fourie, H.; Mc Donald, A. H.; Steenkamp, S. and De Waele, D. (2017). Nematode pests of leguminous and oilseed crops. In *Nematology in South Africa: a view from the 21st Century*. Springer, Cham. pp. 201-230.
- Goodey, J. B. (1957). Laboratory methods for work with plant and soil nematodes. *Tech. Bull. No.2 Min. Agric. Fish Ed. London*, 47pp..
- Goswami, B. K., and Singh, S. (2004). Fungal bioagents for management of root-knot nematode in tomato. *Pest. Res. J.* 16(1): 9-12.
- Goswami, J.; Pandey, R. K.; Tewari, J. P. and Goswami, B. K. (2008). Management of root knot nematode on tomato through application of fungal antagonists, *Acremonium strictum* and *Trichoderma harzianum*. *J. Environ. Sci. Health Part B*, 43(3): 237-240.
- Gupta, R.; Saikia, S. K. and Pandey, R. (2017). Bioconsortia augments antioxidant and yield in *Matricaria recutita* L. against *Meloidogyne incognita* (Kofoid and White) Chitwood Infestation. *Proc. Nat. Acad. of Sci., India Sec. B: Biol. Sci.* 87(2): 335-342.

- Hammerschmidt, R. and Smith-Becker, J. A. (1999). The role of salicylic acid in disease resistance. Induced plant defenses against pathogens and herbivores: Biochem. Ecol, Agric. 37-53.
- Henkle-Dührsen, K., and Kampkötter, A. (2001). Antioxidant enzyme families in parasitic nematodes. Mole . Biochem. Parasitol. 114(2): 129-142.
- Higaki, W. A. and de Araujo, F. F. (2012). Bacillus subtilis and abamectin for nematode control and physiological changes in cotton grown in soil naturally infested. Nematropica 42(2): 295-303.
- Hussey, R.S. and Barker, K.R. (1973). A comparison of methods of collecting inocula of *Meloidogyne* spp. including a new technique. Plant Dis. Repr. 57: 1925-1928 .
- Ibrahim, I. K. and Mokbel, A. A. (2009). Occurrence and distribution of the root-knot nematodes *Meloidogyne* spp. and their host plants in Northern Egypt. Egypt. J. Experi. Biol. (Botany) 5: 1-7.
- Kerry, B. R. (2000). Rhizosphere interactions and the exploitation of microbial agents for the biological control of plant-parasitic nematodes. Annual Rev. Phytopathol. 38(1): 423-441.
- Khan, M. R. and Haque, Z. (2011). Soil application of *Pseudomonas fluorescens* and *Trichoderma harzianum* reduces root-knot nematode, *Meloidogyne incognita*, on tobacco. Phytopathol.Medit. 50(2): 257-266 .
- Khan, A. M.; Ahmed, A. and Saxena, S. K. (1964). Attractiveness of excised roots of plants to root-knot nematode *Meloidogyne incognita* (Kofoid and White) Chitwood. Indian J. Experi. Biol. 2(4): 208.
- Khan, S.; Choudhary, S.; Pandey, A.; Khan, M. K. and Thomas, G. (2015). Sunflower oil: efficient oil source for human consumption. Emergent Life Sci.Res., 1:1-3.
- Kim, H. M.; Park, J. H.; Choi, I. S.; Wi, S. G.; Ha, S.; Chun, H. H. and Park, H. W. (2018). Effective approach to organic acid production from agricultural kimchi cabbage waste and its potential application. PloS ONE 13(11): e0207801.
- Klessig, D.F.; Durner, R. Noad; Navarre, D.A.; Wendehenne, D.; Kumar, D.; Zhou, J.M.;Shah, J.;Zhang, S.; Kachroo, P.; Tarifa, Y.; Pontier, D.; Lam, E. and silva, H. (2000). Nitric oxide and salicylic acid signaling in plant defence. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA. 16: 8849-8855.
- Kloepper, J.W.; Rodríguez-Kábana, R.; McInroy, J. A. and Young, R. W. (1992). Rhizosphere bacteria antagonistic to soybean cyst (*Heterodera glycines*) and root-knot (*Meloidogyne incognita*) nematodes: identification by fatty acid analysis and frequency of biological control activity. Plant Soil 139(1): 75-84.
- Labudda, M. (2018). Ascorbate-glutathione pathway as an important player in redox regulation in nematode-infested plants: what we have learned so far. Physiol. Mole. Plant Pathol. 103: 47-53.
- Lee, D. L. and Atkinson, H. J. (1976). The physiology of nematodes.2nd Edition. Macmillan Press Ltd., London and Basingstoke.
- Lee, Y. S.; Naning, K. W.; Nguyen, X. H.; Kim, S. B.; Moon, J. H. and Kim, K. Y. (2014). Ovicidal activity of lactic acid produced by *Lysobacter capsici* YS1215 on eggs of root-knot nematode, *Meloidogyne incognita*. J. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 24(11):1510-1515.
- Leonetti, P.; Zonno, M. C.; Molinari, S., and Altomare, C. (2017). Induction of SA-signaling pathway and ethylene biosynthesis in *Trichoderma harzianum*-treated tomato plants after infection of the root-knot nematode *Meloidogyne incognita*. Plant Cell Repr. 36(4): 621-631.
- Lindberg, G. S. (1981). An antibiotic lethal to fungi. Plant Dis.65: 680- 683 .

- Lorito, M., Woo, S. L., Harman, G. E., and Monte, E. (2010). Translational research on *Trichoderma*: from 'omics to the field. Annual Rev. Phytopathol. 48:395-417.
- Mahadatanapuk, S.; Sanguanserm Sri, M.; Cutler, R. W.; Sardud, V., and Anuntalabhochai, S. (2007). Control of anthracnose caused by *Colletotrichum musae* on *Curcuma alismatifolia* Gagnep. using antagonistic *Bacillus* spp. Amer. J. Agric. Biol. Sci. 2: 54-61.
- Mahgoob, A. E. A. and Zaghlool, S. A. M. (2002). Effect of salicylic and jasmonic acids on the response of tomato plants to root-knot nematode, *Meloidogyne incognita* infection. Ann. Agric. Sci. Cairo 47(3): 1107-1113 .
- Marek-Kozaczuk, M. and Skorupska, A. (2001). Production of B-group vitamins by plant growth-promoting *Pseudomonas fluorescens* strain 267 and the importance of vitamins in the colonization and nodulation of red clover. Biol. Ferti. Soils 33(2):146-151.
- Maxwell, D.P. and Bateman D.F. (1967). Changes in the activities of some oxidases in extracts of Rhizoctonia-infected bean hypocotyls in relation to lesion maturation. Phytopathology 57: 132-136 .
- Mazzuchelli, R. D. C. L.; Mazzuchelli, E. H. L., and de Araujo, F. F. (2020). Efficiency of *Bacillus subtilis* for root-knot and lesion nematodes management in sugarcane. Biol. Control 143: 104185.
- Mohamed, M. M. (2005). Studies on Nematode Pests Associated with Some Oil Crops and their Control Methods. Ph. D. Thesis, Fac., Agric., Al-Azhar Univ., 182 pp.
- Molinari, S. and Miacola, C. (1997). Antioxidant enzymes in phytoparasitic nematodes. J. Nematol. 29(2): 153.
- Nagesh, M.; Asokan, R., and Mohan, K. S. (2005). Partial characterization of novel nematocidal toxins from *Bacillus cereus* and their effect on root-knot nematode, *Meloidogyne incognita* (Kofoid & White) Chitwood. J. Biol. Control 19(1): 65-70.
- Nandi, B.; Sukual, N.C.; Banerjee, N.; Sengupta, S.; Das, P. and Babu, P.S. (2002). Salicylic acid and enhances resistance in cowpea against *Meloidogyne incognita*. Phytopathol. Medit. 41:39-44.
- Naserinasab, F.; Sahebani, N., and Etebarian, H. R. (2011). Biological control of *Meloidogyne javanica* by *Trichoderma harzianum* and salicylic acid on tomato. Afri. J. Food Sci. 5(4): 276-280.
- Nielsen, K. F.; Thrane, U.; Larsen, T. O.; Nielsen, P. A. and Gravesen, S. (1998). Production of mycotoxins on artificially inoculated building materials. Intern. Biodeter Biodegr. J. 42(1): 9-16.
- Niknam, G.R. and Dhawan, S.C. (2002). In vitro study on the efficacy of *Bacillus subtilis* strain BSt cell concentrations and cell-free culture filtrates on hatching and mobility of *Rotylenchulus reniformis*. Indian J. Nematol. 32: 9-15.
- Osman H. A.; Youssef M. M. A.; El-Gindi, Abd-El-Moniem. Y., Ameen, Hoda H., Abd-Elbary, Nagwa A. and Lashein, Asmahan, M. S. (2012). Effect of salicylic acid and *Pseudomonas fluorescens* against *Meloidogyne incognita* in eggplant using split-root technique. Pak. J. Nematol. 30(2): 101-113.
- Perry, R. N. and Clarke, A. J. (1981). Hatching mechanisms of nematodes. Parasitology 83(2): 435-449.
- Pilorgé, E. (2020). Sunflower in the global vegetable oil system: situation, specificities and perspectives. OCL 27: 34.

- Rao, D. R.; Basu, R. and Biswas, D. R. (2014). Aerobic bacterial profile and antimicrobial susceptibility pattern of pus isolates in a South Indian Tertiary Care Hospital. *Surgery* 36: 35-29.
- Renault, A.S.; Deloire, A. and Bierre, J. (1996). Pathogenesis-related proteins in grapevines induced by salicylic acid and *Botrytis cinerea*. *Vitis* 35: 49–52 .
- Ruiz, S. E.; Cristóbal, A. J.; Reyes, R. A.; Tun, S. J.; García, R. A. and Pacheco, A. J. (2014). *In vitro* antagonistic activity of *Bacillus subtilis* strains isolated from soils of the Yucatan peninsula against *Macrophomina phaseolina* and *Meloidogyne incognita*. *FYTON* 83: 45-47.
- Ryan, N. A.; Duffy, E. M.; Cassells, A. C. and Jones, P. W. (2000). The effect of mycorrhizal fungi on the hatch of potato cyst nematodes. *Appl. Soil Ecol.* 15(2): 233-240.
- Seo, Y., and Kim, Y. H. (2014). Control of *Meloidogyne incognita* using mixtures of organic acids. *The Plant Pathol. J.* 30(4):450.
- Sharma, P. and Rakesh, P. (2009). Biological control of root-knot nematode; *Meloidogyne incognita* in the medicinal plant; *Withania somnifera* and the effect of biocontrol agents on plant growth. *Afri. J. Agric. Res.* 4(6): 564-567.
- Sharon, E.; Bar-Eyal, M.; Chet, I.; Herrera-Estrella, A.; Kleifeld, O. and Spiegler, Y. (2001). Biological control of the root-knot nematode, *Meloidogyne javanica* by *Trichoderma harzianum*. *Phytopathology* 91(7):687-693 .
- Sharon, E., Chet, I., Viterbo, A., Bar-Eyal, M., Nagan, H., Samuels, G. J., & Spiegel, Y. (2007). Parasitism of *Trichoderma* on *Meloidogyne javanica* and role of the gelatinous matrix. *Eur. J. Plant Pathol.* 118(3): 247-258.
- Sikora, R. A. (1992). Management of the antagonistic potential in agricultural ecosystems for the biological control of plant parasitic nematodes. *Annual Rev. Phytopathol.* 30(1): 245-270.
- Silveira, E.D. (2001). Plant growth-promoting bacteria and disease biocontrol. Barros R. and Micheleff S.J. *Plant protection in sustainable agriculture*. Recife, UFRPE University Press, 71-100.
- Sirohi, A. and Rohatgi, D. (2006). Salicylic acid induced resistance against *Meloidogyne incognita* in tomato. *Annals Plant Prot. Sci.* 14(1): 188-190.
- Snell, F.D. and Snell, C.T. (1953). *Colorimetric method analysis including some turbidimetric and nephelometric methods*. D. Van., Nostrand Company IVC. Toronto. New Yourk, London, 111: 606-612.
- Southey, J. F. (1986). *Laboratory methods for work with plant and soil nematodes*. Minist. Agric., Fish. Food, London, 202pp.
- Spiegel, Y. and Chet, I. (1998). Evaluation of *Trichoderma* spp. as a biocontrol agent against soilborne fungi and plant-parasitic nematodes. *Integ. Pest Manag Rev.* 3(3): 169-175.
- Tanda, A. S.; Atwal, A. S. and Bajaj, Y. P. S. (1989). *In vitro* inhibition of root-knot nematode *Meloidogyne incognita* by sesame root exudate and its amino acids. *Nematologica*, 35(1): 115-124.
- Taylor, A.L. and Sasser, J.A. (1978). *Biology, identification and control of root-knot nematodes (Meloidogyne species)*. North Carolina State Univ. Graphics. USA. 111pp .United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) (2019). *Oilseeds and products annual 2019*, Gain Report Number: EG19004.
- Vlamakis, H.; Chai, Y.; Beauregard, P.; Losick, R. and Kolter, R. (2013). Sticking together: building a biofilm the *Bacillus subtilis* way. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* 11(3): 157-168.

Zaghloul, R. A.; Neweigy, N. A.; AbouAly, H. E.; El-Sayed, H. E. and Bahloul, A. M. (2015). Nematicidal activity of some biocontrol agents against root-knot nematodes in vitro. Res. J. Pharm. Biol. Chem. Sci. 6(1): 429- 438.

الملخص العربي

تأثير التكامل بين عوامل مكافحة الحيوية ومضادات الأكسدة في الحد من الاضرار التي تسببها نيماتودا تعقد الجذور لنباتات عباد الشمس

دينا صلاح الدين إبراهيم¹، هويدا عبد الوهاب متولى² وعاطف محمد الصغير³(*)

1 قسم بحوث الأمراض النيماتودية والمعمل المركزي للبيوتكنولوجيا معاهد أمراض النباتات، مركز البحوث الزراعية، مصر

2 المعمل المركزي للزراعة العضوية - مركز البحوث الزراعية، الجيزة، مصر

3(*) قسم الحيوان الزراعي والنيماتودا، كلية الزراعة، جامعة الأزهر أسبوط، مصر

تعتبر نيماتودا تعقد الجذور واحدة من أكثر أنواع النيماتودا النباتية شيوعاً و التي تصيب محصول عباد الشمس في مصر. و في هذا السياق، اجريت الدراسة الحالية لمعرفة كيفية تعزيز تأثير مكافحة الحيوية للنوع *Meloidogyne incognita* بواسطة *Trichoderma harzianum* و *Bacillus subtilis* بمفردهما أو بالاشتراك مع مضادات الأكسدة (حمضى الأسكوربيك والسلسليك) كاستراتيجية محسنة للمكافحة الحيوية. بشكل عام. وقد أظهرت النتائج قدرة هذه الاستراتيجية على تثبيط أعداد النيماتودا مقارنةً بالكنترول، حيث اوضحت النتائج ان الدمج بين *B. subtilis* و *T. harzianum* سجل أعلى انخفاض معنويًا في تعداد النيماتودا (72.3% و 80.0% على التوالي). بينما لوحظ أفضل تأثير تآزري عند الجمع بين *T. harzianum* وحمض السلسليك (74.9% و 84.9%). كما انعكس هذا التأثير إيجابياً على نمو النبات من خلال حث انتاج المركبات المناعية للنبات (المحتوى الفينولي والإنزيمات المؤكسدة).